

DR. HOWELL'S RESPONSES TO QUESTIONS, April 16, 2002, Dr. Howell's office, MSB, Newark

- Dr. Howell was unaware of the date of the last performance evaluation he wrote for Dr. Bishayee. He said he doesn't track when evaluations are due for his staff, but responds to notifications from HR.
- Prior to Dr. Bishayee's resignation on July 30, 2001, Dr. Howell had frank discussions with him concerning the ill will in the lab and the "uncomfortable working conditions" due to the dispute between Dr. Hill and Dr. Bishayee. Dr. Howell felt that Dr. Hill would not leave Dr. Bishayee alone and therefore it was best for him to leave the lab. In fact, Dr. Howell encouraged Dr. Bishayee to find a position outside the University entirely. For this reason, Dr. Howell did not give Dr. Bishayee any letter of recommendation for any internal position, but would have done so if he had found a position elsewhere.
- Dr. Howell stated that he has not changed his opinion of Dr. Bishayee as an excellent technician as a result of the misconduct proceeding or for any other reason.
- Dr. Howell is aware that Dr. Bishayee now works in the department of Pharmacology & Physiology, and runs into him from time to time. Dr. Bishayee has told him that he is applying for a position in Radiation Safety, and also that he just got married.
- Dr. Bishayee performed the experiments that demonstrated the "bystander" effect of radiation on neighboring cells which were the subject of Dr. Howell's first publication on this topic in 1999. Although no one else in Dr. Howell's lab has repeated these experiments, the bystander effect has been found by many other investigators in many types of cell both prior to and since Dr. Howell's 1999 publication. In fact, the bystander effect field has mushroomed, and there are at least 100 papers in the literature about it to date.
- The purpose of the specific experiment in March 2001 which was the subject of the misconduct allegation was to try a new experimental technique, cell sorting, in order to explore further the nature of the bystander effect; its purpose was not to discover new knowledge. Cell sorting physically separates the irradiated cells from the neighboring cells, while in the original bystander experiments both types of cells were plated out together. Dr. Howell has not repeated or continued these cell-sorting experiments in his lab since Dr. Bishayee left because he has not had the staff to do so, but he intends to take up this line of investigation in the near future with the arrival of a new postdoctoral fellow.
- It would be impossible to repeat *precisely* Dr. Bishayee's experiment because the line of cells and the serum Dr. Bishayee used are no longer available. Dr. Howell is unaware of anyone, such as Dr. Lenarczyk, trying to reproduce the experiment in question. He supposed that Dr. Lenarczyk could have done so without his knowledge but it would not have been easy. He also doubts that Dr. Lenarczyk has the technical expertise to do so.

- Dr. Howell reviewed with me Dr. Bishayee's Coulter counts for the experiment in question. He criticized them as being too low, saying he would have turned up the counter at least fivefold. But he did not think the variation in the counts of each tube was unusually small. He pulled out one of his own Coulter count experiments and showed that the variation he got was very similar.

Karen Putterman

4/16/02

DR. BISHAYEE'S RESPONSES TO QUESTIONS, April 17, 2002, OAA, Newark

- Dr. Bishayee decided to leave Dr. Howell's lab following the conclusion of the misconduct proceedings for two reasons. One was the relationship with Dr. Hill and the allegation she had brought against him which made him feel uncomfortable working in close proximity. The more important reason, according to Dr. Bishayee, was his desire to upgrade his technical skills in basic molecular biology which he felt he could not accomplish by staying with Dr. Howell. He wants to further his development and career with the ultimate goal of becoming an independent researcher. At about this time, Dr. Debkumar Pain arrived in Dr. Thomas's department at NJMS. Dr. Bishayee had known Dr. Pain from the past and had great admiration for him and interest in his line of work. Dr. Pain offered to take him into his lab and teach him new techniques.
- Dr. Bishayee did not feel that Dr. Howell asked him to leave the lab. He stated that he asked Dr. Howell to write a letter of recommendation for him for an external position that he was exploring prior to making his arrangements with Dr. Pain. It is his understanding that Dr. Howell did write such a letter and sent it directly to the outside individual. Dr. Bishayee did not receive a copy. He did not ask for a recommendation for Dr. Pain because Dr. Pain did not require it, having known Dr. Bishayee from the past. Dr. Bishayee reports that his relationship with Dr. Howell is unchanged and a good one.
- Dr. Bishayee also told me he was exploring a new position in Radiation Safety which would enhance his career but still allow him to collaborate with Dr. Pain on research that is germane to Radiation Safety.
- Dr. Bishayee confirmed the arrangements for his new H-1B visa, and also mentioned that he had visited India briefly in order to be married, then returned with his new wife.
- I congratulated Dr. Bishayee on his marriage and new position, and offered to make myself available to him if additional work-related issues arose for which I might be of assistance.

Karen Putterman
4/17/02

Kay Fields >1/16/02 rec. lab.

Howell

2-5067 - responses 5/17/02

At issue is data that Howell put into his grant
Competitive renewal & is published.

hexamer effect w. tritium has not
been reproduced. - This is true

is there data in the lab to support the above?

- didn't expect the results at the time - were
controls - repeated 4x at the time - not clear
willing to fax specific figures that it
under question. can be
reproduced.

* experiments done afterward makes him
question whether it can be
reproduced. Nevertheless, he still
believes in the correctness of the
original data, altho the effect may
not be real.

He himself never tried to reproduce it.
He has the notebooks in good keeping.